

Navajo County Community College District Governing Board Meeting Minutes

February 18, 2020 – 10:00 a.m.
Painted Desert Campus, Tiponi Community Center
2251 East Navajo Boulevard, Holbrook, Arizona

Governing Board Member Present: Mr. Frank Lucero; Mr. Daniel Peaches; Mr. Derrick Leslie; Mr. Everett Robinson; Mr. Elias Jouen (Missed the first vote).

Governing Board Member Present by Phone:

Governing Board Member Absent:

Staff Present: President Mark Vest; Vice President for Administrative Services (VPAS) Maderia Ellison; Chief Information Officer (CIO) Scott Estes; Recording Secretary to the Board Terrie Shevat.

Others Present: Kim Reed; Betsy Wilson; April Horne; Ann Hess; Peggy Belknap; Josh Rogers; Rebecca Hunt; Laura Parsons; Judy Yip-Reyes; Rickey Jackson; Ryan Jones; Gail Campbell; Renell Heister; Ernie Hess; Amber Hill; Inez Schaechterle; Curtis Stevens; Lauren Maestas; Jolina Barron; Karen Zimmerman; Jeremy Raisor; Matt Weber; Lance Heister; Kurt Palmer.

Others Present by Phone:

Agenda Item 1: Call to Order and Pledge of Allegiance

Chair Lucero called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. and asked for all present to join him in a moment of silence for White Mountain Apache Police Officer David Kellywood who was killed in the line of duty early Monday morning. Officer Kellywood was a graduate of the college's Northeast Arizona Law Enforcement Training Academy class of 2019.

Chair Lucero then led the Pledge of Allegiance.

Agenda Item 2: Adoption of Agenda

*Mr. Robinson moved to adopt the agenda as presented. Mr. Leslie seconded the motion. **The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against.***

Agenda Item 3: Call for Public Comment

None.



Agenda Item 4: Reports

4.A. Financial Position

VPAS Ellison addressed the Board and reviewed the Financial Position Report noting that revenues were slightly ahead of expectations due to the last minute additional funding received in the state budget.

4.B. NPC Student Government Association (SGA)

Written Report.

4.C. Faculty Association

Ryan Jones, Chair of the English Department which also encompasses Languages, Humanities, and Philosophy, addressed the Board and presented on new initiatives within the department, such as a co-requisite program between English and Math. Mr. Jones also noted some of the new courses developed and taught, particularly by newer members of faculty, and the fact that the English Department had gone bookless to save their students money. Mr. Jones and other faculty will attend a Conference on Open Access educational resources at Mesa Community College.

Mr. Leslie asked that a follow-up report on the Open Access conference be provided to the Board at a future meeting.

4.D. Classified & Administrative Staff Organization (CASO)

Rebecca Hunt, President of CASO, addressed the Board and noted the efforts improve the organization continued and she hoped to have more to report in March.

4.E. NPC Strategic Planning and Accreditation Steering Committee (SPASC)

April Horne, Academic Advisor at the White Mountain Campus, addressed the Board and provided an update from SPASC, highlighting the attempt to add a student to the committee.

Mr. Leslie asked if all Shared Governance groups had student participation. President Vest reported that this is the first year that students have been added and the SGA made a commitment to participate. Mr. Leslie asked that he be kept informed of student participation.

4.F. Friends and Family

Director Wilson addressed the Board and provided an update on upcoming Friends and Family activities highlighting a Scholarship Workshop that will take place on the college's distance system between 12pm and 2pm on Friday, February 21, 2020 inviting Board members to attend. Recording Secretary to the Board reminded members to inform him if they planned to attend as it may need to be posted as a Board Activity. Director Wilson also provided details on the efforts Friends and Family was making for Arizona Gives Day, which will take place on April 7th this year.

4.G. Human Resources

Written Report.



Agenda Item 5: Consent Agenda

- A. **January 21, 2020 Work Session Minutes**
- B. **January 21, 2020 Regular Meeting Minutes**
- C. **January 21, 2020 Executive Session 1 Minutes**
- D. **January 21, 2020 Retreat Minutes**
- E. **Policies 1402 through 1470**

Mr. Robinson made a motion to accept the consent agenda as presented. Mr. Leslie seconded. The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Jouen, Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against.

Agenda Item 6: Old Business

None.

Agenda Item 7: New Business

7.A. Office of Institutional Effectiveness

Dr. Judy Yip-Reyes, Director of Institutional Effectiveness, addressed the Board and provided a quarterly update from the office noting the internal and external reporting recently completed. Director Yip-Reyes offered to meet with the Board in a Work Session to provide further data and context in the Board so wished.

Chair Lucero asked when the college would receive the final report from the Higher Learning Commission. President Vest responded that they hoped to have the final recommendation by the end of April.

7.B. High School Programs: Building Relationships

Renell Heister, Project Director for Title III TALON Grant, addressed the Board and presented on the partnerships the college has with our area High Schools and the continued efforts to develop those relationships.

7.C. Request to Approve Talon Consortium IGAs

Renell Heister reviewed the request to approve IGAs for a consortium agreement to replace the current TALON Grant initiative.

Mr. Leslie made a motion to approve the TALON to Consortium IGAs as presented. Mr. Jouen seconded. The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Jouen, Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against.

7.D. AC4 Marketing Group Presentation

Ann Hess, Director of Marketing & Public Relations, addressed the Board and presented on the work undertaken by the Marketing sub group of the Arizona Community College Coordinating Council (AC4).

Mr. Leslie asked for a copy of the Key Messaging document. President Vest offered to send it to all Board members with his weekly report.



7.E. Request to Approve Increase to Budget Allocated for Website Work

Ann Hess reviewed the request to increase the budget allocated for website maintenance.

Mr. Leslie confirmed the request was to increase the yearly cap to \$80,000.00 for this fiscal year and next fiscal year. President Vest noted that the college would review the ongoing costs and make a decision on whether it would make more sense to put the money towards a position within the college rather than continuing with a contract service.

Mr. Leslie made a motion for the college to move forward as presented. Mr. Robinson seconded. The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against. Mr. Jouen was absent for the vote.

7.F. Request to Submit Proposal to AZ Dept. of Education to Continue the Provision of Adult Basic Education Services

Gail Campbell, Associate Dean of Education and College & Career Preparation, addressed the Board and reviewed the request to submit a proposal to the Arizona Department of Education for the continuation of the provision of Adult Basic Education services at the college.

Chair Lucero asked if the \$650,000.00 was for four years. Dean Campbell responded that it was the annual amount for each of the four years. Chair Lucero asked how much the college had received in the past. Dean Campbell responded that the college generally receives between \$500,000.00 and \$600,000.00 in grant funds and NPC has a required 25 percent match on these funds.

Mr. Jouen made a motion to approve the request to submit a proposal to the Department of Education to continue the provision of Adult Basic Education services as presented. Mr. Robinson seconded. The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Jouen, Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against.

7.G. Request to Approve Purchase of Desktop Computers, Laptops With Docking Stations, and Monitors

CIO Estes addressed the Board and reviewed the request to approve the purchase of computer equipment noting this was an annual endeavor and would target the computers that could not support Windows 10 and Office 2019.

CIO Estes also noted that the quote provided in the Board packet was incorrect and specified an item that could only be sold to the Healthcare industry. The quote had been updated to the correct item description and product number and the cost did not change. He offered to provide a copy of the new quote to Board members if needed.

Mr. Jouen asked how often computers were replaced at the college and if it was a budgeted item each year. CIO Estes responded that the college had a lifecycle replacement cycle for equipment and an annual budget line for said replacement.



Mr. Leslie asked that the new quote be added to the Permanent Board Records maintained by the college.

*Mr. Robinson made a motion to approve the purchase of Desktop Computers, Laptops with Docking Stations, and monitors in the amount of \$258,408.01 which includes all applicable taxes. Mr. Peaches seconded. **The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Jouen, Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against.***

7.H. Request to Approve Purchase of Cisco Telepresence Endpoints for Model Classrooms

CIO Estes reviewed the request to purchase Cisco Telepresence Endpoints for the 9 Model Classrooms at the college noting that this was also a lifecycle replacement.

*Mr. Peaches made a motion to approve the request to purchase the Cisco Telepresence Endpoints for Model Classrooms. Mr. Leslie seconded. **The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Jouen, Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against.***

7.I. Request to Approve Purchase of Cisco Telepresence Endpoints for CCP, and Audio Classrooms

CIO Estes reviewed the request to purchase Cisco Telepresence Endpoints for the 9 CCP and 9 Audio classrooms at the college noting this had been put off while faculty deliberated on what technology they would like to use in the classrooms.

Mr. Jouen confirmed the prices were based on an Arizona State Procurement Contract that the college was piggybacking on.

*Mr. Jouen made a motion to approve the request to purchase Cisco Telepresence Endpoints for CCP and Audio classrooms in the amount of \$418,051.13 as presented. Mr. Peaches seconded. **The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Jouen, Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against.***

7.J. 2020-2021 Tuition and Fees

VPAS Ellison reviewed the proposed Tuition and Fees which shows a \$3 rise in tuition for each of the next three years.

Chair Lucero asked how much revenue is usually generated from tuition. VPAS Ellison responded that it was around \$4 million each year.

Mr. Robinson asked if other community colleges had an out-of-district tuition rate. VPAS Ellison offered to provide that information at the next Board meeting.

Chair Lucero asked if other Community Colleges in the state charged for Dual Enrollment classes. VPAS Ellison responded that they do and it ranges from \$25 to the full tuition rate.



The Board suggested they would like to see information on a \$2 increase for the next fiscal year and \$3 for the next two years, which could be reduced in a future meeting if needed.

7.K. Board Training Options

President Vest discussed the training options provided through the Arizona School Board Association and the associated costs. The Board asked for an action item at the March Board meeting to gain a consensus on whether to move forward with membership.

7.L. Place Director of Human Resources Position on Salary Scale

Chair Lucero mentioned that he would rather not discuss all the issues in the Human Resources area of the college and asked for a motion to have a Chief Human Resources Officer (CHRO) on the salary scale at an E1 level.

With no motion forthcoming President Vest provided a history of the Director of Human Resources position and the salary levels at the college from D3 through E1.

Chair Lucero provided an anecdotal summary of a Human Resources position he heard about in Tucson and suggested the way the position was currently set up in the college meant the Director could not do their job due to other areas of the college telling them what they wanted. Chair Lucero suggested there had been a lack of best practices at the college, particularly in Purchasing, since he joined the Board and now he was seeing it in Human Resources. He also reported that he was informed that the previous Human Resources Director at the college did not meet the credentials for the current position but he had checked and they did. He saw the issue as less about the person the college hires but more of an institutional problem that nobody wants to listen to the person they hire. People want to hire whoever they want, regardless of background checks, which he was shocked the college do not complete nor do they fingerprint, and opened the college to the issue of child molestation. He felt the college needed someone in that position that can do their job without interference other than by their direct supervisor, the President.

Mr. Jouen asked if they were placed at that E1 level will they automatically be empowered. Chair Lucero suggested they would have the power to not be told what to do by other people.

Mr. Leslie asked if the Human Resources report from Traaen and Associates had been reviewed by Shared Governance groups. Chair Lucero states it had not and he believed it didn't need to go through Shared Governance. President Vest noted that Board Policy broadly delegates Personnel decisions to the President with Board guidance. Chair Lucero stated the college would not attract the right person for under \$100,000.00 in salary.

President Vest provided the dollar amounts of the salary levels for each bracket to the Board as there was confusion. Mr. Jouen stated he did not see empowerment coming from the salary level but rather from the President, to empower the person and direct others not to interfere with their day-to-day activities. Chair Lucero restated that they would not find anyone meeting the requirements at a D2 level and there was a hierarchy in every organization, using Mr. Jouen as an example he said Mr. Jouen would take direction from the City Manager but not a shipping clerk. Mr. Jouen agreed there is always an organizational chart showing who reports to who but



it has nothing to do with salary as, using himself as an example, if he makes more money it does not mean he can bully other employees. Chair Lucero noted the problem of bullying was not the money but the position, when a person is subordinate to another they can be told what to do. Mr. Leslie confirmed that the position had been pulled down for the discussion. President Vest noted that it was on hold and removed from the website pending the Board's decision. Mr. Leslie noted the Traaen report had recommendations and he would like to see them implemented. Chair Lucero stated they needed a person to implement the changes that met the required qualifications.

Chair Lucero confirmed the Director position was posted at a D1 level and asked if there had been any applicants that met the qualifications. President Vest responded that the job was posted internally at the college for one week, but with the expectation that they would not have anyone meeting the qualifications. At the end of this one week posting it was pulled down and there was no way to tell if we would have qualified individuals from outside the college apply.

Mr. Jouen asked when the position had last been posted. President Vest responded that it was a little over two years ago with a different set of qualifications.

Mr. Jouen asked President Vest for his recommendation. President Vest stated that he had posted the position at a D1 which made his position relatively clear on the matter.

Mr. Jouen confirmed that Chair Lucero wanted to place this position at an E1 or E2 but without changes to the position description or the expectations for the position. President Vest noted the position description had already been changed to include the recommendations made by the consultant. Mr. Jouen asked what the problem was with allowing the current position to run its course and see if there is a good pool. Chair Lucero said his opinion was they were "kicking the can down the road" and the college has enough internal problems as it is costing the college money.

Mr. Jouen asked how much turnover the position had seen. Chair Lucero responded that in 10 years the college had seen 12 Human Resources Directors. President Vest suggested 8 in ten years which included interims between permanent appointments.

Mr. Jouen made a motion to direct the college President to post the Director of Human Resources position as a Chief Human Resources Officer in the E2 salary range. Mr. Robinson seconded. The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Jouen, Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. Mr. Leslie voted against.

7.M. March and April Meeting Dates

President Vest noted that the March Board meeting fell during Spring Break, when the college was closed, and the April meeting was during the Higher Learning Commission Annual Conference with Board Member Robinson committed to attend and asked if they wished to move either meeting.

The Board discussed the potential options put forward by President Vest.



*Mr. Peaches made a motion to move the March Board meeting to Tuesday, March 24th 2020 and the April Board meeting to Tuesday, April 14th 2020. Mr. Robinson seconded. **The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Jouen, Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against.***

Agenda Item 8: Standing Business

8.A. President's Report

President Vest informed the Board that he would attend the Community College Day at the Legislation on Wednesday, February 19th with employees and students. The first week in March is Northland Pioneer College's week at the Legislation and planning was well underway to have students available to shadow legislators.

8.B. Agenda Items/Informational Needs for future meetings

Mr. Leslie asked for follow-up information from faculty on their attendance at the Conference on Open Access educational resources at Mesa Community College during the Faculty Association Report.

Mr. Robinson requested information on out of District Tuition rates at other community colleges in Arizona during the discussion on 2020-21 Tuition and Fees. Mr. Robinson also asked when the next Academic Calendar would be with the Board for Approval and for an update on the Surgical Technology and Therapeutic Massage programs.

Agenda Item 9: Board Report/Summary of Current Event

None.

Agenda Item 10: Announcement of Next Regular Meeting: Regular District Governing Board meeting on Tuesday, March 24, 2020.

Agenda Item 11: Adjournment

*The meeting was adjourned at 12:05 p.m. upon a motion by Mr. Jouen and a second by Mr. Robinson. **The vote passed upon a roll-call vote with Mr. Jouen, Mr. Robinson, Chair Lucero, Mr. Leslie, and Mr. Peaches voting in favor. There were no votes against.***

Respectfully submitted,



Paul Hempsey
Recording Secretary to the Board

