ASSURANCE SECTION

Northland Pioneer College
Holbrook, Arizona
October 26-28, 2009

FOR

The Higher Learning Commission
A Commission of the North Central Association of Colleges and Schools

EVALUATION TEAM

Susan L. Minnick (Team Chair), Dean of Academic Foundations/General Education
Waukesha County Technical College
Pewaukee, Wisconsin 53072

Dr. Phillip D. Birdine, Vice President of Academic and Student Support Service
Western Oklahoma State College
Altus, Oklahoma 73521

Dr. Susan A. Deege, Senior Lecturer in Business
Culver-Stockton College
Canton, Missouri 63435

Dr. Bill Lamb Vice, President of Instruction
Kirkwood Community College
Cedar Rapids, IA 52406

Dr. Michael Walraven, Professor of Psychology
Jackson Community College
Jackson, MI 49201

Contents

I. CONTEXT AND NATURE OF VISIT

A. Purpose of Visit
The purpose of the visit was to conduct a comprehensive evaluation for continued accreditation at the associate's degree level.

B. Organizational Context
Northland Pioneer College is a comprehensive two-year institution located in Northeastern Arizona. Established in 1972, NPC is a NCA-HLC accredited public community college serving over 13,000 students annually in a wide range of courses and programs. The College is decentralized so that they can provide individual communities with learning opportunities to meet their needs and those of the residents in their area. NPC does not have a main campus but rather has four campuses and six centers. The campuses/centers are from 34 miles apart to a maximum of 250 miles apart.

The service area includes the tribal homelands of the Navajo, Hopi, and White Mountain Apache people. This area is one of most remote and least populated in Arizona with a population of approximately 181,000. The two counties that the college serves are the Apache and Navajo Counties; which are two of the poorest 100 counties in the country. This area is also culturally diverse with Native Americans comprising 46.4% of the population of Navajo County and 71.1% of Apache County.

Distance education is a key component to the success of the College. Through the use of various means of communication the college is able to offer small numbers of students at many sites opportunities to take courses leading to programs.

C. Unique Aspects of Visit
None

D. Sites or Branch Campuses Visited
- Little Colorado Campus-Winslow
- Painted Desert Campus-Holbrook
- Silver Creek Campus-Snowflake-Taylor
- White Mountain Campus-Show Low
- NPC District Office-Holbrook
- Hopi Center- Polacca Canyon

E. Distance Education Reviewed
The team discussed and visited classrooms utilizing distance education. The WAN system is enabling expanded audio and visual transmission capacity to classrooms in the district. The use of white boards integrated into video courses is one of the methods that have greatly enhanced the potential of learning opportunity for students. The use of distance education is integral to providing a quality education to students in remote settings.

F. Interactions with Constituencies
Meetings at the White Mountain Campus (Show Low, Arizona)
    Students (46)
    Community Representatives (21)
    Faculty (20)

Staff (8)

Meetings at the Little Colorado Campus (Winslow, Arizona)
    Students (8)
    Community Representatives (15)
    Faculty (12)
    Staff (10)
Meetings at Silver Creek Campus (Snowflake-Taylor, Arizona)
    Students (22)
    Community Representatives (24)
    Performing Arts Center Staff (2)
    Faculty (5)
    Staff (12)
Meetings at the Painted Desert Campus (Holbrook, Arizona)
    Students (28)
    Community Representatives (18)
    Faculty (14)
    Staff (13)
Principal, Holbrook High School
Mayor, Holbrook, Arizona
Sergeant, Arizona Department of Public Safety
Office Manager, Daystar Television Network
Retiree, County Government
Navajo County Recorder, Holbrook, Arizona
Navajo County Assessor, Holbrook, Arizona
Social Science Teacher, Holbrook Junior High School, Holbrook, Arizona
Special Education, Holbrook Junior & Senior High School, Holbrook, Arizona
Holbrook Junior High School & Holbrook City Council, Holbrook, Arizona
Education Specialist, Director of Education - Navajo Nation, Holbrook, Arizona
President Chamber of Commerce, Holbrook, Arizona
Apache County Higher Education Committee
NPC Apache County Coordinator
Utility Solar Engineering President
Systems Analyst/DBA/Web
I.S. Department Manager
Lead I.S. Technician
Academic Advisor/Library Technician
Director Enrollment Services
Director of Marketing
SBDC Academic Advisor
Faculty
SRP Coronado Generating Station Training Supervisor
SRP Coronado Station Manager
Career Services Employee
College President
Academic Advisor - Painted Desert Campus
SBDC Director
SBDC Holbrook Office Coordinator
Dean of Career and Technical Education and Nursing, Arts & Sciences
Community Education Coordinator
Instructional Council (23)
Enrollment Management Plan Committee Members
BIT Partnership Meeting (3)
Navajo County CC District Governing Board (3)

Vice President for Learning and Student Services
Vice President for Administrative Services
Director of Human Resources
Head Librarian-Painted Desert Campus
Director of Financial Aid
Career Services Advisor/GED Chief Examiner (LCC)
Campus Manager (LCC)
Campus Monitor (LCC)
Retention Specialist (LCC)
Associate Librarian (LCC)
Assessment of Student Knowledge Committee
NPC Foundation Director and Board Members

G. **Principal Documents, Materials, and Web Pages Reviewed**
Capital Budget Project Development Plan
Career Services Flyers and Schedule of Events
Carl Perkins Annual Reports
Classified Staff Bylaws, Professional Development, Activity
Constellation Survey
Construction Technology Program Review
Cosmetology Program Review
Disability Resources & Access Support Services & Guidelines
Eagle Briefs – Student Newsletter
ECD Program Review
Education Program Review
Educational Assistant Program Review
Emergency Medical Technician Program Review
Employee Handbook - 2009-2010
Faculty Association Bylaws
Faculty Handbook
Faculty Roster
Fire Science Program Review
Graduating Student Satisfaction Questionnaire
Homegrown Healers Grant
Learning Services Handbook
Marketing Samples – PAC Schedule; CTE Brochures; Community Education Schedule;
    Class Schedules; Catalog CD; Viewbook; Commencement Booklet
New Faculty Orientation Materials
Northern Flight (Literary Magazine) - 1999-2000 & 2006-2009
Northland Pioneer College Catalog
Northland Pioneer College Foundation Scholarships
Nursing Program Review
Photography Technician Program Review
Placement Handbook
Power Plant Program Review
Qualified Faculty by Department
Report of Admission of Students Under 18
Self Study
Self Study Appendix
Self Study Letter of Accreditation
Self Study Report

Self Study Response
Self Study Visit Report
Small Business Development Center Annual Report Booklet
Strategic Enrollment/Marketing Plan
Strategic Plan - 2008 & 2009
Student Government Constitution
Student Services Satisfaction Survey
U.S. Department of Education Funds Disbursed Through NPC

II. COMMITMENT TO PEER REVIEW

A. Comprehensiveness of the Self-Study Process
The Strategic Planning and Accreditation Steering Committee was established in 2006 with the intention of combining both Strategic Planning and the Self-Study. Eight additional committees were formed to address each of the five criteria and also communications, data, and the resource room. All members of the college community had an opportunity to become part of the self-study process by participating on a team and/or reviewing the team report.

B. Integrity of the Self-Study Report
NPC's Self-Study Report analyzed and evaluated the present state of the College. The visiting team found that Northland Pioneer College created a Self-Study Report that reflects all the hallmarks of effective self-study reports as stipulated in the Higher Learning Commission Handbook for Accreditation. The report was extremely reflective in accurately identifying strengths and weaknesses.

C. Adequacy of Progress in Addressing Previously Identified Challenges
During the 1999 visit to NPC, the visiting team identified five concerns. These were addressed in the Self-Study and the team spent time analyzing the concerns and talking with administration, staff and faculty about these issues.

The team found the following challenges have been met:
- The College has not moved aggressively enough to complete the Wide Area Network (WAN) and the Local Area Networks (LANS) to determine the appropriate computer operating system, and to provide e-mail and internet access for instruction and administration.
- Although the college is viewed positively in the community for its contributions, it has taken a narrow approach to its role in economic development.
- Team interviews with student suggest inconsistent quality in the delivery of instruction.
- At several sites, the practice of testing students in public areas without appropriate supervision may compromise instructional integrity.
- The college is not positioning itself to effectively meet its present and future personnel needs. This will be addressed in Criterion 2.

There was a progress report regarding the development of facilities and technology implementation submitted and accepted by HLC in 2003.

D. Notification of Evaluation Visit and Solicitation of Third-Party Comment
Requirements were fulfilled. No third-party comment was received.

III. EVALUATION OF FEDERAL COMPLIANCE PROGRAM COMPONENTS

A. Credits, Program Length, and Tuition

The team has reviewed this component of federal compliance. NPC offers programs of study leading to the following degrees: Associate of Arts; Associate of Science; Associate of Applied Science; Associates of Business; Associate of Arts in Elementary Education; Associate of General Studies; and Associate of General Studies in Early Childhood Education (four tracks: Early Childhood Management, Infant Toddler, Pre-School, and Special Needs Education Assistant). Two certificates include: Certificate of Applied Science and Certificate of Proficiency. In addition, NPC offers training and short courses as well as developmental programs and GED. The program length and number of credit hours found in these programs are within the range of those found at other similar institutions. There are two tuition rates: one for In-State and one for Out of State, and both are comparable to the lowest in the State of Arizona. For students taking more than three or more credits, there is a small media fee, and some courses have other fees ranging from $10 to $25. Credits posted on student transcripts are clearly labeled and conform to generally accepted practices,

B. Student Complaints

The team has reviewed and determined that NPC has documented a process for addressing student complaints and appears to be systematically processing such complaints as evidenced by the data on student complaints for the three years prior to the visit.

C. Transfer Policies

The team has reviewed this component of federal compliance.   NPC publishes its transfer policies in the NPC College Catalog. Further, NPC participates in the Course Applicability System which provides mechanisms for transfer between Arizona public universities and community colleges.

D. Verification of Student Identity

The team has reviewed that NPC verifies the identity of students who participate in courses or programs provided to the student through distance or correspondence education.

E. Title IV Program and Related Responsibilities

The college has presented evidence on the required components of the Title IV Program. The team has reviewed these materials and has found no cause for concern regarding the institution's administration or oversight of its Title IV responsibilities.

1. General Program Requirements:

The institution has provided the Commission with information about the fulfillment of its Title IV program responsibilities, particularly findings from any review activities by the Department of Education.

2. Financial Responsibility Requirements:

The institution has provided the Commission with information about the Department's review of composite ratios and financial audits. The 2007 recertification to participate in the Title IV programs was designated as "Provisional" due to repeated instances of late submission of A-133 audits. NPC has addressed and resolved the tardiness of audit submissions and has addressed these issues the Department raised regarding the institution's fulfillment of its responsibilities in this area.

3. **Default Rates, Campus Crime Information and Related Disclosure of Consumer Information, Satisfactory Academic Progress and Attendance Policies:**
    The institution has demonstrated, and the team has reviewed, the institution's policies and practices for ensuring compliance with these regulations. The college does not participate in any federal student loan programs, including Stafford, Federal Family Education Loan Program (FFELP), PLUS, Perkins and Direct Loans, thus there is no default rate. The College has a Satisfactory Academic Progress Policy which is publicized in the catalog and on the web site. Attendance policies are enforced.

4. **Contractual Relationships:**
    The team has reviewed this component of federal compliance and NPC has no contractual relationships with non-accredited third party providers.

F. **Institutional Disclosures and Advertising and Recruitment Materials**
    The institution has documented that it provides accurate, timely and appropriately detailed information to current and prospective students and the public about its accreditation status with the Commission and other agencies as well as about its programs, locations and policies.

    The team reviewed many marketing and advertising materials and found the information to be accurate and reliable. Items examined included the College catalog, view book, website class schedules, community education mailer, PAC events schedule, brochures for CTE programs, SBDC materials, mission statement bookmark, recruitment materials and various newspaper clippings.

E. **Relationship with Other Accrediting Agencies and with State Regulatory Boards**
    The institution has documented that it discloses its relationship with any others specialized, professional or institutional accreditor and with all governing or coordinating bodies in states in which the institution may have a presence.

    The team has reviewed this component of federal compliance. The College does not have specialized accreditation with any single agency the status of which covers one-third or more of either the institution's offering or its students other than HLC. However the college is subject to the standards and regulations of several external agencies:
    -   NPC's nursing program is approved by the Arizona State Board of Nursing and is currently in the process of applying for NLN accreditation.
    -   NPC's Paramedicine program is certified by the Arizona Department of Health Services.
    -   NPC's Therapeutic Massage program is credentialed through the Arizona State Board of Massage Therapy.
    -   NPC's Cosmetology program is licensed by the Arizona State Board of Cosmetology.
    -   NPC's Welding program is accredited through the American Welding Society.
    -   NPC's Education department provides courses for teacher certification requirements in Structured English Immersion (SEI) mandated and regulated by the Arizona Department of Education.

F. **Public Notification of an Evaluation Visit and Third Party Comment**
    The institution has made an appropriate and timely effort to solicit third party comments; no third party comments were submitted.

IV. FULFILLMENT OF THE CRITERIA

A. CRITERION ONE: MISSION AND INTEGRITY. The organization operates with integrity to ensure the fulfillment of its mission through structures and processes that involve the board, administration, faculty, staff, and students.

1. Evidence that Core Components are met:
- The College provides a welcoming environment to all; faculty, staff and students; who report feeling comfortable and are fairly treated. There is truly a sense of community that was apparent to the team. Both the faculty and the staff reported on the strength of the college administration, as well as a great feeling of trust and of being supported.

- A discussion with NPC employees along with the results from the HLC Constellation Survey indicate that the college has a clear, concise and expansive mission statement along with well-articulated supporting visions, values, and purposes. They also agree that the mission must shape the decisions that the college makes and the directions that it goes.

- NPC has long lasting relationships with area industries, including the SRP-CGS Power Plant. NPC has partnered with the plant to bring needed on-site training to current and potential employees. The Plant Manager and Training Supervisor met with the team and stated that through this partnership skilled craftsmen have developed standardized curriculum and effective training to ensure a supply of well trained employees for the future. It was further discussed that potential employees come from as far away as Phoenix for the training so that they may be employed by the power company in the future.

- The Small Business Development Center and BIT work closely together on related projects and goals to ensure efficient delivery of services to the communities.

- Review of NPC documents and conversations with financial aid office staff confirm that the college is committed to meeting applicable federal Title IV compliance regulations specifically related to financial aid audits. The realization that what occurred to put them in a provisional status will not occur again as processes are in place to alleviate the problem. A review of the NPC website and public documents demonstrate a consistency of information and messages being presented to NPC constituencies.

2. Evidence that one or more specified Core Components need organizational attention:
- It appears that because of the budgetary constraints the personnel structure is a bit "thin" in areas and individuals are currently handling more than one job. Some open positions are not being filled, and the affects of the increased stress is beginning to be felt. The College needs to be cognizant of the extra burdens it is placing on many of its staff and articulate strategies to help protect the very positive work environment that currently exists.

- NPC's administration and Board have developed a shared governance policy, but the faculty has not reacted to that proposal at this time. Until the faculty develops ownership in this process shared governance at a documented formal level cannot occur. A discussion with faculty and administration revealed that collaboration exists at all levels; thus moving to a formalized shared governance model should not present challenges to the administration, Board or faculty.

- NPC's has had four Presidents since the last team visit. The turmoil that occupied the College and the Board appears to have stabilized. The College has done an excellent job of identifying strengths and areas for improvement. In the Self-Study, there is little discussion of the Board's role as it relates to the institution. Reviewing the role of a College Board as it relates to the involvement in the College would assist the college and the Board to make informed decisions.

3. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components require Commission follow-up:**
   None

4. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components are not met and require Commission follow-up: (Sanction or adverse action may be warranted.)**
   None

Recommendation of the Team
Criterion is met; no Commission follow-up recommended

B. **CRITERION TWO: PREPARING FOR THE FUTURE.** The organization's allocation of resources and its processes for evaluation and planning demonstrate its capacity to fulfill its mission, improve the quality of its education, and respond to future challenges and opportunities.

   1. **Evidence that Core Components are met:**
      - In the process of developing the strategic plan along with the self study, the college effectively evaluated its strengths and weaknesses. This approach has enhanced planning and resource consciousness within the institution. Strategic planning, by definition, is multi-year and strategic goals rarely can be met in one year. As a result, the NPC leadership team emphasized their commitment to engaging in strategic planning annually, and from interviews at all levels, this commitment to continued planning and system improvement seems to alive at the college. As NPC moves into the future, the sound planning foundation in place will serve as a guide and a direction for innovation and student support.

      - Conversations with the college personnel reveal an organization that is fully cognizant of their resource challenged institution. NPC has created a three year plan for quality improvement (Three-Year Plan for Quality Improvement in an Uncertain Fiscal Environment), which is expected to facilitate decision making in extremely difficult economic times. The college has established a committee that will begin addressing budget shortfalls, which will be communicated to the entire campus.

- The college is committed to maintaining a decentralized organizational structure, which enables each campus and center to operate autonomously while following district policies governing educational program development. Each of the communities in the college's vast service area is highly supportive and well served by this approach, as related by each of the four community member groups that talked with the team. In many instances, the Centers and Campuses serve as community support systems. In some areas, the only services provided include computer labs and libraries, especially those on the reservations.

- The college serves a most diverse population, and its planning documents and historical records, document its sensitivity to the unique needs and limitations of each constituency. The diversity of the communities makes environmental scanning and uniform community needs assessment difficult, as revealed in both the self-study and the supporting documents in the resource room. Nonetheless, community members consistently applauded the college's more personalized means of determining and meeting their educational needs.

- In its most recent iteration, the strategic plan demonstrates alignment with the college's statements of mission, purposes, values, and vision, as well as the core components of the Higher Learning Commission's criteria for accreditation. This indexing demonstrates awareness of the multivariate matrix within which the organization operates, an awareness confirmed by the team in numerous interviews. This planning strategy enables the college to effectively monitor progress within its planning cycle, and prepares the organization dynamically to address exigent concerns.

- Observations by the visiting team reveal that computer technology resources support student learning and effective teaching. NPC has been able to equip many of its classrooms with the latest in instructional technology (i.e. smart boards, interactive television (ITV) upgrades, and expanded bandwidth capacity). The latter provided for technology driven service solutions to student academic tutoring issues, specifically for students located at remote campuses and centers, to be addressed.

2. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components need organizational attention:**
   - At present, NPC's institutional research functions are in an early formative state, and not ready to provide the level of analysis which would permit assessment of institutional effectiveness. While some descriptive data (e.g. enrollments by course, time of day, schedule format, etc) are available, these data are not regularly analyzed. Strategic data collection will depend on organizational determination and selection of critical indicators of effectiveness, coupled with operational definitions of desired outcome variables. The organization should involve all employee groups, in at least the initial phase of this effort, since all members of the college have a vested interest in the achievements to be measured. Ultimately, the organization will also have to decide how often to monitor each index of institutional effectiveness, how to assign responsibility for such monitoring, and how to report the outcome data to its various constituencies.

- Levels of planning at NPC are in place, but not fully implemented. Many initiatives designed to support and enhance student learning and community service are emerging, and committees are formed and functioning. However, the results of these planning efforts are still only visions of the future yet to be realized and supported by any significant data or research. The many elaborate plans and beginning discussions are not always interrelated clearly to demonstrate continuity across effort. Although not intentionally competitive, they may not be aligned well with the realities of available resources. The administration and board's plan to list those projects or operations that might need to be eliminated due to budgeting problems is commendable; however, it is imperative that there is college-wide *consensus* on what priorities will rise to the top. The next steps will challenge the commitment of the faculty and staff and will define the parameters for successful future assessment. At this point, the initiatives are simply too new to affirm their effectiveness at enhancing the capacity to fulfill the mission. It is imperative in these difficult economic times that planning to move the college occurs; rather than just cutting things out of the budget so that the college can survive.

- Interviews with faculty and staff and a review of resource room material provided evidence that the campus has recently developed a technology hardware rotation process, which will permit the on-going maintenance of the technology infrastructure. Faculty and students at the Little Colorado Campus expressed their desire for NPC's leadership team to focus on the technology infrastructure, particularly as it relates to distance education/ITV broadcasts. Faculty and students pointed out that, in far too many instances, ITV broadcast feeds were of poor video quality with total loss of the video feed sometimes taking place. NPC's leadership team is aware of these issues and emphasized on-going efforts to correct these problems through maintenance and upgrades to the technology infrastructure.

- As noted in conversations with the Steering Committee and with Center staff, NPC does not have a comprehensive orientation or college skill development option for students. The absence of these opportunities causes a lack of understanding on the part of students in terms of financial aid applications and college admission requirements. In terms of college skills, students may leave the protection of their small classes and instructional venues without the personal management skills to deal with budget, career planning, and so forth. Attention to ways to help students, especially first generation students, to become informed related to college funding opportunities and college culture in general will benefit the communities served.

3. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components require Commission follow-up;**
   None

4. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components are not met and require Commission follow-up: (Sanction or adverse action may be warranted.)**
   None

Recommendation of the Team
Criterion is met; no Commission follow-up recommended.

C. **CRITERION THREE: STUDENT LEARNING AND EFFECTIVE TEACHING.** The organization provides evidence of student learning and teaching effectiveness that demonstrates it is fulfilling its educational mission.

1. **Evidence that Core Components are met:**
   - The processes for development and modification of courses and programs are well defined and functional. Interviews with faculty and administrators confirm that faculty, typically in collaboration, originate, review, and approve courses and programs of study. Moreover, regularly scheduled program reviews result in frequent modifications of courses and programs to maintain currency and improve student learning.

   - Faculty are leading the movement to define student learning outcomes and measurement strategies for each course in the taxonomy. As new courses are developed, and as programs are reviewed and modified, the course objectives are updated. By interviews and review of documents, the team verified the effectiveness of this process. Consequently, courses offered by the college are generally perceived as current and effective in advancing the student's knowledge and skills

   - The curriculum and selected programs are appropriate for the College and the region it serves. Conversations with campus groups and individuals confirm the need to focus in the future on the areas that relate to sustainability and renewable energy as well as other program opportunities. Workforce development is important for the future of the area, and career program curriculum consistency can benefit graduates as they enter the competitive area marketplace.

   - NPC has been assessing student learning at the course level for many years, and faculty's review of those data has resulted in course modifications intended to improve student learning. In recent years, an appraisal of the overall assessment effort has led the college to join the Assessment Academy sponsored by the Higher Learning Commission. At the time of this visit, the team, by review of documents and interviews with faculty and administrators, is impressed with the progress the college Assessment Academy team and other leaders have made. Continuing progress in the current trajectory should be expected to advance the college to an assessment strategy which will encompass course and program levels. Coupled with other critical indicators, this momentum will eventuate in extending the scope of assessment to include institutional variables.

   - The Enrollment Management Team's recommendations to expand tutoring for students have been implemented this fall. Faculty are now tutoring students directly in math through audio instruction using the SMART board and in chemistry and biology using the video delivery system. Fifty-five students are currently receiving additional instruction through this endeavor. The college intends to track these students success and continue to offer this service to students, if applicable.

   - NPC provides solid evidence of its commitment to supporting student learning and effective teaching. NPC libraries have been established at each of its campuses

and centers. The libraries serve as a central focal point for community educational activities. The library staff are very responsive in assisting faculty and students to secure educational resources. Computer labs are easily accessible and have operational hours conducive to meeting student and community member needs.

- NPC is committed to effective teaching, and works to ensure that faculty have materials necessary to support successful student learning, including maintained facilities, modern technology, transportation to centers and campuses, and electronic resources. As reported by adjunct faculty interviews, they participate in orientation and professional development, and can earn credits to advance in status at the college. Professional development is encouraged and supported for all faculty, even in times of financial challenge. Full-time faculty seeks consistency in course content and objectives; however, faculty evaluation is inconsistent in several areas, especially with dual enrollment courses. The ability to insure consistency of curriculum and instruction across all areas is not evaluated or clearly documented.

- Recognizing the need to provide learning opportunities in all areas served throughout this wide region, NPC has made a significant commitment to technology in audio and video classroom instruction and online course delivery. To supplement this delivery, the college has a commitment to an onsite presence of faculty at distant centers and campuses to provide face-to-face instruction and support, and this strong commitment is a hallmark to quality student learning support. To sustain their decentralized delivery model, the college will need to continue to rely heavily on technological solutions and additional technical support for students, which clearly reflects the organizational commitment throughout the districts.

- NPC has a clear commitment to student success and has worked most recently to define and affirm placement test scores in reading, writing, and math. The work of the committee last year identified a clear connection with reading and math success, and the current initiative to look at general education course placement requirements demonstrates a focus on student success. As these individual efforts continue, the college focus on learner success will be realized and supported by research and data.

2. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components need organizational attention:**
   None

3. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components require Commission follow-up:**
   None

4. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components are not met and require Commission follow-up: (Sanction or adverse action may be warranted.)**
   None

Recommendation of the Team
Criterion is met; no commission follow-up recommended.

D. **CRITERION FOUR: ACQUISITION, DISCOVERY, AND APPLICATION OF KNOWLEDGE.** The organization promotes a life of learning for its faculty, administration, staff, and students by fostering and supporting inquiry, creativity, practice, and social responsibility in ways consistent with its mission.

1. **Evidence that Core Components are met:**
   - As noted in the self study and confirmed through interviews with faculty and staff, NPC supports economically disadvantaged students with tuition waivers to provide access and opportunity as well as to encourage learning. For example, the initiative to support recently jobless individuals by giving a semester of free tuition is noble and clearly community focused. Enrichment opportunities provided on campuses and at centers encourage community use of facilities and the expertise of staff and faculty. Many examples of opportunities for lifelong learning were cited and support this college value effectively.

   - The general education distribution is present in virtually all courses offered by the college, and many go well beyond the minimum to instill students with a commitment to learning far more than their skill or trade competency, and even beyond the basic content objectives of the curriculum. Several examples were cited in Chapter Four of the self-study, and the faculty and administrative commitment to these values of inquiry and critical thinking were evident in individual and group discussions experienced through the team visit.

   - NPC has comprehensive policies and procedures outlining computer usage, library usage, use of facilities, and plagiarism. Faculty, Student, and Employee Handbooks provide clear guidelines about ethical and behavioral expectations and provide procedures for resolving grievances and disputes. Meetings with employees and students confirm the effectiveness of these policies, and these discussions clearly noted the availability of these policies to all employees.

   - NPC staff and administrators benefit from professional development opportunities through five initiatives/goals stipulated in the 2008-2011 Strategic Plan. These initiatives specify staff training in legal issues, technology and pedagogical strategies and techniques. The institution is strongly supportive of ongoing professional development activities for its faculty through the Faculty Professional Development Committee (FPDC). A review of FPDC records indicates that this organization awards funding based on the strength of applications received from full-time and certain adjunct faculty. Additionally, the NPC administration remains committed to supporting professional development. It has implemented a strategy allowing for a percentage reduction in the annual faculty development budget, which mirrors the percentage reduction from state allocations. NPC's administration feels that this action will ensure the sustaining of this important activity in periods of severe budget constraints. Because of the funding cuts that have occurred faculty are designing their own professional development opportunities to assist other faculty.

   - NPC's Lifeline Program offers a one semester tuition and fee waiver to individuals who have lost their job within the last six months. The NPC Foundation offers an accompanying book scholarship to students receiving this waiver. This activity

reflects the institutional value for learning and community support. From a variety of interviews, both employees and community members noted the value of the programs that help students have access to learning.

- As noted in interviews with adjunct faculty members, support is given to assist with curriculum consistency and classroom instructional techniques. Adjunct faculty are a valued part of the institution, and feel no distinction from their role compared to that of the full-time faculty. In many instances, adjunct faculty are the lead discipline experts, and have full support in their curriculum development and classroom experiences.

- The college involves advisory committees in its program review process, thus maintaining congruency between learning outcomes and employment-related skills. In addition, the team learned during meetings with members of the larger community that the college regularly seeks information about emerging community needs, and opportunities for the college to serve better the diverse communities in which it is embedded. Thus, the college provides its students with skills and abilities to be competent members of a diverse workforce.

- The NPC faculty expects and encourages students to accept responsibility for their learning, both during and after college. Syllabi reflect learning outcomes, including continuing individual learning, and the college mission statement is focused on lifelong learning. By review of documents and interviews, the team confirmed that students are well prepared for lifelong learning.

2. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components need organizational attention:**
   - Program reviews demonstrate that the college responds to recommendations made by employers and members of advisory committees in maintaining the currency and relevance of its programs. In addition, the diversity of the student population assures that students are well prepared to live and work in a diverse society. Further, the level of technology used in instruction should be expected to produce graduates fluent in its use. However, the college is not yet able to complete the requisite assessments of program outcomes to define the usefulness of its curricula to students who will live in a global, diverse, and technological society.

   - Although limited by financial resources, NPC has continued to sustain a decentralized service to a very large service area, and in many instances, faculty travel significant distances to provide face-to-face learning opportunities. Certainly the technology of television and audio delivery helps to reduce some of this travel; however, the use of online learning opportunities continues to be limited, and with less than enthusiastic faculty support. As quality evaluation systems are available, NPC should work to develop online programs as originally planned, and find ways to reduce the travel requirements of full-time faculty.

3. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components require Commission follow-up:**
   None

4. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components are not met and require Commission follow-up: (Sanction or adverse action may be warranted.)**

None

Recommendation of the Team
Criterion is met; no commission follow-up required.

E. **CRITERION FIVE: ENGAGEMENT AND SERVICE.** As called for by its mission, the organization identifies its constituencies and serves them in ways both value.

1. **Evidence that Core Components are met:**
   - Advisory Board meeting minutes demonstrate the active involvement of community members and working professionals. The NPC Self Study documents numerous organizations, partnerships, and programs from which NPC seeks input and direction and for whom NPC has created special programs and services. Examples include dual enrollment, Early Childhood training at multiple centers, special tribal programs, and workforce training and nursing education sites at multiple locations.

   - The Performing Arts Center provides quality cultural programming appropriate to the various constituencies and audiences of NPC's communities*. The Northern Flight* magazine highlights the creative efforts of NPC students.

   - Through partnerships, creative scheduling, mobile faculty members, and multiple work assignments, NPC has demonstrated its commitment to engage with its identified constituencies and communities under the current "decentralized" structure.

   - The College's role in the community is paramount to the communication available. In many of the areas the center/campus is the only place to utilize a computer and/or wireless access.

   - The Small Business Development Center provides much needed educational offerings and one-on-one counseling to small business owners and aspiring entrepreneurs. Online courses are accessible to distance learners. The website and other publications highlight entrepreneurial success stories including a Dollar Store opening on the Navajo reservation. The SBDC is reacting to the changing nature of industries by providing training for emerging industry trends. An example is the Southwest Sustainable Forests Partnership. Community Education collaborates with community resources, such as the Extension Service, to provide timely and well received programming. Examples include Solar Greenhouse Design and Living Soil.

   - Conversations with the Little Colorado Campus (LCC) cosmetology program officials and participants reveals that the program participants routinely offer free, personal assistance to community members undergoing treatment for cancer, as does the program at White Mountain Campus (WMC). The students and LCC/WMC staff assist these patients in the securing, styling and fitting of cosmetic wigs and hair pieces which helps to builds confidence and increases the self esteem of patients who have experienced hair loss due to chemo therapy treatment.

- Team members met, at all four campuses with community representatives and students who enthusiastically confirmed the importance of NPC's role in providing much needed educational and cultural programs throughout the service areas.

2. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components need organizational attention:**
None

3. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components require Commission follow-up:**
None

4. **Evidence that one or more specified Core Components are not met and require Commission follow-up: (Sanction or adverse action may be warranted.)**
None

Recommendation of the Team
Criterion is met; no further Commission follow-up required.

V. STATEMENT OF AFFILIATION STATUS

A. **Affiliation Status**
Continued accreditation

B. **Nature of Organization**

1. **Legal status: Public**

2. **Degrees awarded: Associate**

C. **Conditions of Affiliation**

1. **Stipulation on affiliation status**
No Change

2. **Approval of degree sites**
None

2. **Approval of distance education degree**
No Change

4. **Reports required**

Progress Report
None

Monitoring Report
None

Contingency Report
None

5. **Other visits scheduled**
None

6. **Organization change request**
None

D. **Commission Sanction or Adverse Action**
None

F. **Summary of Commission Review**
Timing for next Comprehensive Visit 2019-2020

Rationale for Recommendation
The team believes that Northland Pioneer College meets the five core components for the continued accreditation from the Higher Learning Commission. Because of that the team is recommending the next Comprehensive Visit occur in ten years. The team believes that Northland Pioneer College has the fiscal and human resources to allow it to continue its service to Northeastern Arizona. The commitment to servicing the area and particularly the individual communities is obvious and genuine. The financial uncertainty created by the current economy in Arizona and across the U.S. is a concern; NPC has a process in place to address these financial challenges. The many changes the college will face need to be addressed with sound planning process and careful assessment of student learning and outcomes. The team has confidence the college can address its challenges and become an even stronger learning institution.

VI. **ADDITIONAL COMMENTS AND EXPLANATIONS**

None

ADVANCEMENT SECTION

REPORT OF A COMPREHENSIVE EVALUATION VISIT

TO

Northland Pioneer College
Holbrook, Arizona
October 26-28, 2009

FOR

The Higher Learning Commission
A Commission of the North Central Association of Colleges and Schools

EVALUATION TEAM

Susan L. Minnick (Team Chair), Dean of Academic Foundations/General Education
Waukesha County Technical College
Pewaukee, Wisconsin 53072

Dr. Phillip D. Birdine, Vice President of Academic and Student Support Service
Western Oklahoma State College
Altus, Oklahoma 73521

Dr. Susan A. Deege, Senior Lecturer in Business
Culver-Stockton College
Canton, Missouri 63435

Dr. Bill Lamb Vice, President of Instruction
Kirkwood Community College
Cedar Rapids, IA 52406

Dr. Michael Walraven, Professor of Psychology
Jackson Community College
Jackson, MI 49201

Contents

I.   OVERALL OBSERVATIONS ABOUT THE ORGANIZATION

Northland Pioneer College is a vital education institution in Northeast Arizona. The College's service to very poor counties is to be commended. The combined economic situation of the state, country and poor counties has not paralyzed the college, but rather seen as just another challenge. You still offer various forms of tuition and book vouchers for students, always putting the student at the center of the institution.

The decentralized nature of the college makes it very responsive to the communities that it serves. The incorporation of technology in delivery of the courses/programs makes them viable to learners in remote areas. The dedication of the faculty and staff to travel makes this model the college has designed effective to students.

The many challenges to NPC necessitate a coordinated approach to planning. The current economic downturn cannot overtake planning at the college, even though the finances are not there to look forward. The college must look to the future to further position the college for growth. Institutional research is in its beginning stages for the college to move into a data driven institution. It must identify what data is needed, how to extract the data, and then finally learn how to use it to make decisions.

II.   CONSULTATIONS OF THE TEAM

A. Student Success

As noted in conversations with the Steering Committee and with center staff, NPC does not have a comprehensive orientation or college skills development option for students. The absence of these opportunities causes a lack of understanding on the part of students in terms of financial aid applications, college policies, college admission requirements and other thing of importance to the student. In terms of college skills, students may leave the protection of their small classes and instructional venues without the personal management skills to deal with budget, career planning, and so forth. The addition of these options as course(s) or workshop(s) for students could provide information needed information prior to beginning their college career. A simple implementation plan for pre-enrollment group orientation days, supported through a college wide effort with faculty and staff, could benefit enrollment and retention, as well as success when students transfer to continue degree programs. The potential benefit would be significant, especially to first generation and returning adult students who may not clearly understand a college culture and learning expectations.

Dual enrollment has many benefits for high school students in that the opportunity provides a college experience with a nurturing high school oversight. However, to ensure the experience is college level, faculty need to have opportunities to interact and to be evaluated by college professionals who understand the differences in levels of competency and learner development. NPC needs to make a commitment to dual enrollment oversight that can work to ensure a consistent college experience for interested high school students. One suggestion provided through group interviews discussed the option of a new position in the north and one in the south areas with the responsibility to coordinate and evaluate instruction on site. These positions could help to ensure consistency and quality across the curriculum. With funding being as

tight as it is currently that may not be a possibility.   However, adapting this recommendation to meet some of the suggestions would improve consistent learning for students.

B. Institutional Research—Data Driven Decision Making

Lack of data to guide decision making processes is a significant concern, and clearly, the college recognizes this need and has begun to address data collection and data use procedures. In conversations with administration and faculty, data included in the self study was not inclusive as Career and Technical Education faculty credentials were not included in the self study report. There is no institutional database that would allow for degree assessment, especially with adjunct faculty. These issues are examples of the lack of trustworthy data, and college personnel are working to correct this. The goal to have quality data for decision making purposes must be maintained if future growth and quality assessments are to be realized.

The college has requested consultation on the development of an institutional effectiveness model of institutional research. The college is well positioned to achieve this goal, having strong leadership commitment, good software and support, and the personnel skilled in designing, creating, managing, and interrogating databases. While far more detailed and extensive information is available from several sources, particularly the Association for Institutional Research (www.airweb.org), the team is pleased to provide some suggestions.

Any task analysis for the design of an IE model begins with the selection of outcomes. Typically, the college will want to examine its mission and purposes, and define measurable outcomes which will answer the question "How well are we doing what we claim to be doing?" NPC is well positioned with a clear mission statement and clearly itemized purposes, each of which can easily be represented by two or three measures.

The definition of data elements requires some careful forethought. As an example, success in preparing students for transfer could be defined as the number of students who transfer each year, or the number who transfer without losing credits, or the number who transfer to their first choice institution. The problem with these measures is that they do not provide stable bases for trend analysis. The college will be well advised to use rate measures, e.g. the percentage of students who elected transfer as a goal who did transfer successfully (further defined as transfer of a percentage of credits).

As the college pursues a data-driven decision-making model, it will also need to develop a culture of evidence. This is much more than the presentation of data which appear to support a particular decision or plan of action. It also involves regular monitoring of key variables (most colleges call them indicators) and the analysis of trends in these variables. It is important to avoid overreaction to what appear major changes. For example, when distance education was new, it was not unusual to see annual growth rates of several hundred percent in enrollments in distance education courses. This did not mean that distance education was growing faster than the overall college enrollment; it was a reflection of the small numbers of students enrolled the prior year(s); in other words, beware the small denominators!

Just as NPC has learned in the area of assessment of student learning, the development of a culture of evidence requires widespread acceptance and pursuit of involvement of college members at all levels. NPC will want to involve as many people as possible in the definition of measures (outcomes) which will reflect success of its purposes.

There are several links between IE and assessment. Many colleges make aggregate assessment data one or more of the elements in their IE reports. For example, the number of courses or programs assessed and/or updated (modified) in the past year, or comparisons of NPC students with regional or national norms on standardized measures. While assessment of student learning is still the province of faculty and still focused on improved learning and teaching, the aggregate results of assessment, particularly of incoming and former students, is part of IE.

This becomes particularly true in measures which reflect efficiency. For example, if NPC chooses to monitor the unit cost of instruction (per FTE student, perhaps), and also monitors the percentage of incoming students who are deficient in reading, writing, and mathematics, the college will likely find that as the percentage of students requiring remediation (TLC) increases, the unit cost of instruction will also increase. By the same token, examination of the percentage of students requiring remediation and the retention rate of students fall to winter will show a clear relationship, almost always inverse (negative correlation). These observations can only be trusted when there are inferential assurances of statistical significance. In some cases, non-parametric statistics will have to be used, due to small numbers of students in some categories or too few years of measures or incomplete data sets. Indeed, for the first few years any trends observed must be considered tentative. If the college wants to educate large numbers of faculty and staff to understand these issues without teaching/reviewing elementary statistics, a reasonable option is found in the quality initiative area (run charts, p charts, etc.) where trends and control limits, as well as special causes, can be understood without mathematical sophistication (or pain?). Whichever course the college chooses to pursue, much patience will be required while a requisite number of years of data collection permit reasonable trend analysis. In the meantime, just as with the monitoring and reporting of progress on the strategic plan, sharing and reporting on elements of institutional effectiveness will encourage wider participation and pride in the work of the institution.

While assessment of student learning focuses on direct measures, IE often blends many indirect measures into the mix. For example, non-returning students who did not complete a program of study could be surveyed to discover the percentage who achieved their goals. Many colleges are pleasantly surprised to find this indicator in the high 80s and 90s. In general, measures of student satisfaction are part of IE, but not part of assessment (student satisfaction is not a course of program learning outcome). Similarly, students in some programs take exams which constitute external validation (concurrent or predictive validity), such as in the health occupations. While the rate of successful completion of such exams is often a measure of assessment at the program level, it is also a measure of IE, as is the rate of employment of graduates (by program or other category, as defined by the college).

The college is cautioned in this effort on several points:
- A common experience is to decide to measure and record every conceivable data element, and then to run every possible cross-tabulation analysis to discover significant relationships. This effort is guaranteed to produce two outcomes: spurious significant outcomes (as Student discovered while developing his famous t-test), and feelings of being overwhelmed and drowning in data. It is better to define the outcomes and measures *a priori*.
- Responsibility for the integrity of the database and the consistency of inquiry language should be assigned specifically. While committees can work well to define priorities for data analysis outside the requisite reports, assigning one position the ultimate authority for the definition of variables will result in far more integrity in both the database and informational reports.
- Many colleges fail to assign sufficient professional staff to the IE function. Inasmuch as this area of responsibility is integral to institutional planning, it is a critical function of the college. As NPC advances this initiative, it may find it necessary to add human resources. For the immediate effort, however, the team was pleased to find that the IR personnel, while already heavily tasked, have sufficient talent and expertise to achieve the transition.
- Many colleges simply adopt a "best practice", numerous examples of which are available from regional or national organizations. While this gives a rapid start, it precludes shared ownership in the effort. NPC is encouraged to examine and adapt, rather than adopt, existing models. After all, NPC is a unique college and will need an IE model appropriate to its character.

Ultimately, a major benefit of an IE model is the invitation to design and conduct experiments. A new approach to achieving a college objective can be compared to the existing model (pilot testing), and accurate comparisons (including of course tests for the statistical significance of any differences found) can be made. The college is reminded of the Hawthorn Effect: any new initiative will demonstrate initial improvement in outcomes as an effect of the novelty of the effort. As demonstrated originally at the Hawthorn plant, any change in the environment improved production on the line. Accordingly, data analysis should occur over several semesters and if possible some counterbalancing of personnel assignments should be involved to avoid the irreproducible results due to champions. Faculty members who teach experimental design can be most helpful in creating designs which avoid some of these problems, including demand characteristics and other forms of unintended bias. As these experiments are reported, they also provide "real-world" examples of the important concepts students learn, often in the abstract.

Reporting and disseminating the results of IE work can be very beneficial to the college. Of course reports can be tailored for different groups of stakeholders. Clearly, the present leadership of the college is expert in communications and internal stakeholders are well-informed. As IE reports are shared with external stakeholders, increased pride in the college is to be expected.

As an organization, NPC is well positioned and ready for the development of an IE model for IR. While this will be a major initiative, and will undoubtedly require additional resources to bring it to fruition, the college has the talent and expertise to begin. The team commends the college for this initiative, and fully expects a successful outcome.

A major benefit of data-driven decision-making is consensus and understanding about major changes, including the decision to discontinue a program of study. For example, the recent discontinuation of a program has created some dissension on campus. Using data from enrollments and from program reviews, employment trends, and employment outlooks, the college may want to develop a protocol for making such decisions. Developing benchmarks for individual programs may help in making these difficult decision.

C. Technology

The student portal provides an excellent opportunity for faculty to provide course information and grade feedback to students on a regular and timely basis, yet many faculty have chosen to not use the product. Professional development opportunities to learn the system are present; however, they may not be available to a decentralized faculty. Because of technological concerns from the past, some faculty may be reluctant to invest time in learning the system; however, the inconsistency in terms of student access and feedback to the same levels of information across course sections is a concern. A more significant effort in terms of professional development and training needs to be mounted to correct this disparity.

NPC has identified course scheduling as an issue and is working to provide alternatives through distance learning and hybrid course plans; however, interview feedback from several venues noted concerns related to scheduling and course options for students, especially those pursuing career and technical degrees.

NPC has many online courses and sought advice from the visiting team concerning the expansion of online learning. Given that online education is increasing in popularity nationally due to convenience and cost, it would be prudent for the College to seriously engage in increased online learning. Given the need for specific course work to be developed, the team offers multiple ideas to engage in this exciting opportunity for Northland Pioneer College.

Foremost, consult the current Higher Learning Commission Handbook concerning proposed changes (7.21). While this section deals with proposed changes such as online degrees (something beyond ICC's wish to simply expand online offerings), the information in the handbook will provide guidance as the institution contemplates a comprehensive plan to initiate increased online course offerings. Additionally, NPC should consult the HLC's website and closely read the Commission's statements on (http://www.ncahlc.org/index.php?option=com_docman&task=cat_view&gid=80&Itemid=236) online learning.

Most faculty at the college have embraced alternative delivery of courses. In order to maintain and expand the core of faculty involved in online teaching, Northland should develop a process to train additional faculty leaders to mentor online teachers, which will ensure continuity in assistance for faculty members as they develop new courses. The College may also want to consider additional training for both new and experienced faculty to keep up to date on the newest technology used to deliver online instruction. Faculty discussed with the team that they are designing internal workshops for faculty improvement; online teaching could be a topic for workshops.

The accreditation team did not find a procedure manual for the development and delivery of online courses at NPC that addressed all online issues, including balancing online and face-to-face sections, any special assessment need for online courses, online advising and student support, online 'best practices' groups for faculty, recommended class sizes for online courses, or processes for determining how online course delivery is monitored for quality. If this handbook does not yet exist, it should be developed to avoid questions and concerns regarding online instruction.

An informal peer review process would be a non-threatening structure in which to assess the quality and effectiveness of online learning and to ensure that the curricula are substantial and coherent. NPC could begin a voluntary informal peer review process among all online instructors where participants could review the peer reviewer comments and suggestions for improvement in delivery methods.

It is also important that students understand what is required to be successful in an online course before the class begins. On the college web site, there is currently a frequently asked question about online classes which may not be enough. Previously in this report, a discussion occurred regarding student orientation and/or a student success course. Many colleges have found it helpful to have part of that online, so students are able to learn what occurs in an online course.   Other colleges have gone to having a student orientation for online learning before they start the course; that should include certain tasks a student must do before class occurs so they can make an informed decision if online is a mode in which they could prosper.

Future plans for continued development of online learning beyond the stated content areas should be conducted openly and honestly in a data-driven environment. Specific planning typically includes a feasibility study, as well as an operational plan. Issues that could be explored would include sustainability, training, maintenance, support, assessment, and student services. Additionally, a marketing plan is a vital component of planning for colleges that have successful online programs.

D. Planning

The college must be cautious about the multiple planning processes that are taking place at NPC overall. Although not intentionally competitive, they may not be aligned well with the realities of available resources. The administration and board's plan to list those projects or operations that might need to be eliminated due to budgeting problems is commendable; however, it is imperative that there is college-wide *consensus* on what priorities will rise to the top. There may be questions that have not been fully addressed that will help to guide the college community to a consensus on priorities. Such questions might include: Will college growth come from transfer or career and technical programs? Will future enrollment growth come from online and alternative delivery or classroom programs? How does the planning for future growth and campus planning connect with student recruitment? How does it connect with fundraising? How do plans for workforce development coordinate with the continued enhancement of existing campus facilities?

It is also imperative that budget cuts don't overtake planning; it is critical that even during this time the college continues to move forward with new initiatives and looks to future endeavors.

E. Shared Governance

From the interviews with administration and the descriptions presented in the self study, NPC views shared governance as an opportunity to advance the institution through an inclusive shared vision and a commitment to involvement by all. Some faculty interviewed verbally noted their commitment, but further movement in this area seems to have been delayed in terms of an association response. Adjunct faculty as well as full-time faculty and staff shared during the team visit that they felt now a clear voice and inclusion at the college, and to this end, a culture shift from the challenges of the past presidential changes seems to have settled the overall climate of the college.

However, with laissez-faire Board of Directors and a lack of timely participation by faculty leadership, the shared governance approach to decision making will not sustain the test of time, especially in time of challenges with resources and programs. Trust by faculty and a commitment to the process is necessary to establish the level of voice in decision making that clearly the president and administration hope to encourage. Without the commitment to the process on the part of faculty, the administration will have to change directions in order to move the plan and goals forward, which in turn could disenfranchise the faculty as had occurred with the past two presidents.

The administration has proposed a process to facilitate the formal process of shared governance. It might be beneficial for both groups to initiate the formal process for a temporary period of time with the intention of reviewing and modifying to make it work effectively for both groups after the trial period.

F. Recruiting a Diverse Staff

The college asked for consultation in recruiting a diverse staff, particularly faculty. All colleges face challenges in recruiting new employees, though the difficulties in rural areas are more extreme.   Nevertheless, it is important the NPC provides an environment of diversity that mirrors the student body.

Developing a process to "grow your own" with faculty is essential to your success in to expand the number of minority faculty. Identifying current students and graduates and friends of the college that are interested in teaching and then providing opportunities to be connected to the college throughout their continued education is essential. Then when they have graduated giving them an opportunity to be a part-time teacher should keep them connected and ready for a full-time position.

In the hiring process it is prudent for hiring teams to identify acceptable candidates that are unranked. That may assist in a broader number of candidates forwarded for each position and give the administration a better opportunity to hire a diverse candidate. A recruiting and hiring orientation/training program could be of assistance. That should include a briefing of selection committees on legal issues, interviewing and selection processes in a fair and non-discriminatory manner.

G. Program Outcomes

As was evident through the Self Study, Chapter Five, and confirmed in conversations with both full-time and adjunct faculty, course level learning outcomes are established

for all courses and many strategies for assessment are in place, although with need for expansion and support. As noted in the Self Study as well, the goal of March 2009 for program level student learning outcomes was in process, and through interviews with faculty and the fact that the researcher was quite new to the college, data from these efforts may be delayed. The decisions made to affect student learning must be grounded in information and data related to outcomes assessment, and although work has been done in this area that demonstrates a college commitment, more inclusion and involvement from all faculty will be necessary to accomplish this goal. Program-level outcomes are often difficult to define. While it is easy to envision program outcomes as the aggregate of the course outcomes within the program of study, there are also somewhat unique outcomes at program's end. These may be seen as transcendent outcomes (e.g., both transfer and technical students develop critical thinking and analytical skills), or super ordinate (technical students develop work ethic/attitudes). In either case, roots of these outcomes can be found in specific courses, but no individual course provides the level of proficiency desired and expected at program conclusion. Historically, transfer "programs" have used general education outcomes as program measures, sometimes adding transcendent skills such as effective collaboration. Whichever pattern NPC chooses, the critical element is that NPC chooses. Program outcomes must match program definitions. In technical programs, these can often be derived from discussions with faculty and advisory committees. Because there is increasing overlap between transfer and technical programs (more and more technical grads eventually transfer), it is reasonable to expect some overlap in program outcomes, although perhaps at different levels of proficiency. Accordingly, the college is encouraged to involve the widest possible group of faculty in the deliberation over program outcomes, in the definition of both the outcomes and the direct measures which will reflect success in its achievement.

H. District Governing Board's Role

Talking with faculty, staff and administration many felt that the Board's role in the college isn't well defined and often times involvement in the College is very limited. In the self-study little discussion occurred regarding the Board at all.

The three members of the Board that the team met with were knowledgeable about the college. However, because of the open meeting law in Arizona the team member could only meet with two of the members at a time. The meeting had not been posted as an open meeting of the Board. It was also noted that the other two members of the board had not acknowledged if they were attending, or not.

The Board, just like the college has gone through unstable times with changes in administration. That period of time appears to have come to an end. The college has gone through a time of challenging and reviewing individual's roles, department's roles and those of the college. The Board has not reviewed their role, the team would encourage the Board to review and clarify their role.

Reviewing a governance model of Boards and adopting a model would be helpful to the College and improve the Board. One specific group that is recognized for their leadership in working with two-year College Boards is the Association of Community College Trustees (ACCT). They provide workshops and/or individualized training that is helpful to the Board such as a Guide to Trustee Roles and Responsibilities, Governance of Learning Institutions, and Board Self-Assessment. Training needs to

occur as a Board with the College President and top administration so that the development of a collegiate model of governance is adopted and accepted by all. Other groups could provide similar training.

As part of a comprehensive plan communication should be addressed. A communication plan would assist in developing a working understanding of the roles and responsibilities among the various levels, and providing a means of collaboration and support. This could include a training plan for Board members, communication process/timelines between Board and Administration, and shared governance procedures. This communication piece within and outside of the College is essential to address the concerns of the noninvolvement of the Board by college personnel.

As part of the review of the Board's role an orientation process for new Board members could be considered. It would give each person a consistent foundation for an understanding of the College. Some meetings and areas to consider when putting together a formal orientation could include: meeting with the President, Vice Presidents, budget, foundation, planning (strategic, facilities and academic), training on the Board's Governance model and other areas that the District Board President and College President find important.

I. Recognition of Significant Accomplishments, Progress, and/or Practices

The college has gone through significant turnover in Presidential leadership. The current administration is respected by all on campus, and has helped the college move forward in a positive direction. The approach to the Self-Study, along with strategic planning, helped the college to identify their strengths and areas where improvement needs to occur. Joining the assessment academy has moved the college forward, so that when they complete the formal academy, the momentum will continue to keep this moving. The economic turmoil occurring in Arizona and throughout the country has had a direct impact on NPC's budget, which will continue for the unforeseen future. The approach, which is being used to identify where funding can be reduced, is open and involves many different constituencies in the college.

The faculty, staff, administration and Board of Trustees are very dedicated to making access of courses/programs affordable and available to students. The college is a learner-centered institution.

INSTITUTION and STATE: : Northland Pioneer College, AZ

TYPE OF REVIEW *(from ESS)*: Continued Accreditation

DESCRIPTION OF REVIEW *(from ESS)*: Also, a visit focused on the institution's request to offer online degrees.

DATES OF REVIEW: 10/26/09 - 10/28/09

Nature of Organization

LEGAL STATUS: Public

TEAM RECOMMENDATION: No Change

DEGREES AWARDED: A

TEAM RECOMMENDATION: No Change

Conditions of Affiliation

STIPULATIONS ON AFFILIATION STATUS: None.

TEAM RECOMMENDATION: No Change

APPROVAL OF NEW DEGREE SITES: The Commission's Streamlined Review Process is only available for offering existing degree programs at new sites.

TEAM RECOMMENDATION: No Change

APPROVAL OF DISTANCE EDUCATION DEGREES: Prior Commission Approval Required

TEAM RECOMMENDATION: No Change

REPORTS REQUIRED: None

TEAM RECOMMENDATION: None

OTHER VISITS REQUIRED: None

TEAM RECOMMENDATION: None

Summary of Commission Review

YEAR OF LAST COMPREHENSIVE EVALUATION: 1999 - 2000

YEAR OF NEXT COMPREHENSIVE EVALUATION: 2009 - 2010

TEAM RECOMMENDATION: 2019 - 2020

ORGANIZATIONAL PROFILE

INSTITUTION and STATE: Northland Pioneer College, AZ **TYPE OF REVIEW** *(from ESS)***:)**: Continued Accreditation   _X__ No change to Organization Profile

Educational Programs

		Program Distribution	**Recommended Change** **(+ or -)**
Programs leading to Undergraduate			
	Associate	53	
	Bachelors	0	
Programs leading to Graduate			
	Masters	0	
	Specialist	0	
	First Professional	0	
	Doctoral	0	

Off-Campus Activities

In-State:		Present Activity:	**Recommended Change:** **(+ or -)**
	Campuses:	Holbrook (Painted Desert) ; Show Low (White Mountain) ; Snowflake (Silver Creek) ; Winslow (Little Colorado)	
	Sites:	Eagar (Springerville/Eagar) ; Heber (Heber) ; Kayenta (Kayenta) ; Polacca (Hopi) ; St. Johns (St. Johns) ; Whiteriver (Whiteriver)	
	Course Locations:	17	

Out-of-State:		Present Wording:	**Recommended Change:** **(+ or -)**
	Campuses:	None	
	Sites:	None	
	Course Locations:	None	

Out-of-USA:		Present Wording:	**Recommended Change:** **(+ or -)**
	Campuses:	None	
	Sites:	None	
	Course Locations:	None	

Distance Education Certificate and Degree Offerings:

Present Offerings:

Certificate in Industrial Mech. & Maint. Tech. offered via Internet

Recommended Change:
     (+ or -)