

Navajo County Community College District 2016-2017 Proposed Budget Public Hearing Minutes

May 17, 2016 – 10:00 a.m.
Painted Desert Campus, Tiponi Community Center
2251 East Navajo Boulevard, Holbrook, Arizona

Governing Board Member Present: Ms. Ginny Handorf; Mr. Daniel Peaches; Mr. James Matteson; Mr. Prescott Winslow; Mr. Frank Lucero.

Staff Present: President Jeanne Swarhout; Interim Vice President Maderia Ellison; Vice President Mark Vest; Director PJ Way; Recording Secretary to the Board Paul Hempsey.

Others Present: Kim Reed; Betsyann Wilson; Rebecca Hunt; Amber Hill; Stuart Bishop; Everett Robinson; Ann Hess; Kelley Harvey-Brannon; Bill Fee; Donna Soseman; Peggy Belknap; Rickey Jackson; Josh Rogers; John Spadaccini; Linda Kor; Ed Gentry; Brad Farber; Wayne Reeves; Martha Brooks; Jay Williams; Dorothy Williams; Ken Wilk; Jorge Meza; Margaret White; Jeremy Raisor.

Agenda Item 1: Call to Order

Chair Handorf called the meeting to order at 10:35 a.m.

Agenda Item 2: Presentation of Proposed 2016-2017 Budget

Interim Vice President Ellison addressed the Board and presented the Proposed 2016-2017 Budget commenting the Preliminary budget adopted in April remains unchanged.

Mr. Lucero asked if there was a document that showed how much tax revenue the other community colleges bring in each year. Interim Vice President commented that the document was provided during the Truth In Taxation meeting but did not list the amount in dollars. Mr. Lucero asked how Northland Pioneer College would compare to other Arizona Community Colleges in terms of revenue brought in from taxes. Interim Vice President Ellison commented that the college is not comparable to Maricopa or Pima Colleges but in terms of budgets we would be in the middle to lower half of rankings.

Mr. Matteson commented that the documents showed Healthcare costs had increased by 20% which was out of the college's control. Revenue generated by Property Taxes is less than last year even after an absolute maximum increase in the rate, by \$147,386, while costs imposed on the college have gone up.

Mr. Matteson asked the percentage cost of Administration at the college. President Swarhout responded that she would estimate at 15% mentioning that during the recession of 2008 the college decreased the administration almost in half and that remains in place today. Mr. Matteson commented that costs, out of the college's control, have gone up, centrally assessed property valuations had decreased significantly but the college was frugal with money, cutting



administration costs in half and spending the money on the education of students, many of whom he was pleased to meet at graduation recently.

Mr. Winslow commented that often, in media articles regarding the cost of administration in education, it is difficult to compare institutions particularly using percentages. As an example he noted that Northland Pioneer College (NPC) does not specifically separate out Information Technology costs for instruction from the costs of running the college overall. Interim Vice President Ellison agreed with Mr. Winslow pointing out that in the budget over \$10 million was marked for Instruction but technology costs were listed under Institutional Support and the majority of money spent by the Information Services department was to support instruction. Mr. Winslow added that one of the reasons the college has a substantial budget for Information Technology is due to the nature of the college as a multi-location institution serving two counties that, combined, are the approximate size of West Virginia. By providing a distance learning model for students of all ages, that is expensive, savings are passed to students who would otherwise have to travel great distances to attend classes.

Mr. Lucero asked if there was a line item for the remodel of the SCC campus. Interim Vice President Ellison responded there was not.

Agenda Item 3: Call for Public Comment

Mr. Farber addressed the board and asked the college to comment on the IPEDS Report and in particular graduation rates, the Kid's College program and how it might figure into the FTSE and his confusion over the reporting of student numbers.

Vice President Vest responded that IPEDS is a federal reporting requirement designed for the universities and really geared toward full-time students. Several years ago Community Colleges were also required to report the same data. IPEDS reporting does not work well for Community College reporting especially those like NPC. To be counted in an IPEDS cohort you have to be a full-time, first-time student which accounts for less than 10% of NPC's student population. A lot of those students are also in the Nursing Program which takes longer to complete than the Federal Government says a full-time student should take to complete a community college degree. Therefore, even though the college has a high completion rate in Nursing they are still listed in IPEDS as non-completers.

There are many other measures that could be used but still NPC is not satisfied with graduation rates and has implemented the PASS program to improve those rates but over the past four years there has been a significant increase in certificates and degree completion. 76% of the college's students are part-time and a large part of the full-time students took Dual Enrollment classes at area high schools and are automatically excluded from IPEDS due to the use of the four year university model. They expect each student to be 18 years old and just out of high school and never had college coursework which is simply not the profile of the community college student. The average student age at NPC is 32 so our typical student does not fit the IPEDS profile or show up on the report.



Vice President Vest went on to discuss the difference between FTSE and Headcount. NPC counts enrollment in two different ways. Internally the college looks at headcount for the reason that, if a student sees an advisor, it is not relevant to the college whether they are part-time or full-time. They are there to meet with an advisor and need to be serviced. The state wants an annual report on what they call Full-Time Student Equivalency (FTSE) which is calculated by taking all the credits that students are enrolled in and divide them by a formula number to give an equivalent number of full-time students. Using Spring Enrollment at NPC as the example Vice President Vest stated the college had 3505 students enrolled in credit bearing classes and around 700 students in non-credit classes giving a total student population of over 4000. Our FTSE count was about 1725. The annualized FTSE number reported to the state last year was 1853 which includes FTSE counts for regular classes in the fall semester, short-term classes which may run a day or week or a month, regular enrollment for the Spring semester, short-term enrollment in the Spring and the summer. Then we need to back out online students from outside the state of Arizona who cannot be included. The state then uses this figure to calculate state aid. Mr. Farber commented that, knowing what he does now, he would be interested to see how many credits were successfully completed last year to establish a pattern for the school moving forward. Vice President Vest mentioned he did not have the data available at the meeting but could provide it at a later time.

Vice President Vest mentioned that community colleges upload data on all their students to a database called ASSIST which the three state universities then use to pull data on students who transfer to universities from community colleges and provide a report on how our student are doing. Two things have been learned from this report. Students who complete at least an Arizona General Education Certificate (AGEC) at community college graduate at a higher rate and sooner from a state university than students who enter as a freshman. Universities suggest this is because it is much cheaper to begin at community college and students from small, rural communities that go to a major university struggle their freshman year, because of the change in culture and the size of classes.

On the subject of Kids College, Vice President Vest stated it is an initiative started a few years ago and run out of the Corporate and Community Learning division with the aim to be self-funded. The teachers hired to teach in Kids College are paid by the fees students pay to be in the class. The rationale and aim is to give kids something that is fun, but also educational, during the summer and spark an interest in college for when they arrive at high school. Over half the classes meet the category for Science, Technology, Engineering, and Math (STEM). The classes are non-credit, and therefore do not count towards FTSE, and along with a consortium of seven other community colleges NPC has a National Science Foundation Grant that provides a lot of the classroom instructional materials and equipment used in the Science and Math classes. Mr. Farber asked how the Dual Enrollment students are counted in the cost of doing business to justify the budget. Vice President Vest stated they were calculated in the total FTSE count of the college but the Legislature tried to deal with this by reducing state aid by half for those students.

Chair Handorf commented about the savings for a student attending a community college and highlighted the Arizona All-Academic Team awards. At the recent NPC Graduation ceremony the keynote speaker, Dr. Rufus Glasper former Chancellor of the Maricopa Community College



system commented that he was always impressed by the percentage of students from NPC receiving awards. Chair Handorf also mentioned the savings to a student through half price tuition for summer classes and the scholarships available at NPC.

Mr. Reeves commented that he would like to see a Certified Audit carried out, by a third party, at the college which could show potential cost saving ideas, efficiency improvements, or ways to increase revenues.

Agenda Item 4: Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 11:18 a.m. upon a motion by Mr. Matteson, a second by Mr. Winslow, and a unanimous affirmative vote.

Respectfully submitted,



Paul Hempsey
Recording Secretary to the Board

