Navajo County Community College District  
2013-2014 Proposed Budget Public Hearing Minutes  
May 20, 2014 – 10:00 a.m.  
Painted Desert Campus, Tiponi Community Center  
2251 East Navajo Boulevard, Holbrook, Arizona

Governing Board Member Present:  Ms. Ginny Handorf, Mr. Daniel Peaches, Mr. James Matteson, Mr. Prescott Winslow, Mr. Frank Lucero

Staff Present: President Jeanne Swarthout; Vice President Blaine Hatch; Vice President Mark Vest; Information Services Director Eric Bishop; Institutional Effectiveness Director Dr. Leslie Wasson; Recording Secretary to the Board Lisa Jayne.

Others Present:  Ann Hess, Everett Robinson, Autom Christensen, Jake Hinton, Tom Nagle, Peggy Belknap, Stuart Bishop, Kenny Keith, Margaret White, Madera Ellison, Sharon Hokanson, Kathleen Ritz, Jenny Shumway, Rickey Jackson, Brad Farber, Beaulah Bob-Pennypacker, Jeremy Raisor, Curtis Casey.

Agenda Item 1: Call to Order  
Chair Handorf called the meeting to order at 10:30 a.m.

Agenda Item 2: Presentation of Proposed 2014-2015 Budget – Vice President Hatch  
Vice President Hatch presented the Proposed 2014-2015 Budget to the Board. He stated the preliminary budget, as approved by the Board at the last regular board meeting, was posted on the College’s website immediately following the April board meeting, as well as a full-page publication in both The White Mountain Independent on May 13 and The Holbrook Tribune on May 14, along with the notice of public hearing. The College is only required to publish in one newspaper but because of the size of the district it is published as broadly as possible. The budget hearing was also noticed in the press release issued to all media throughout the County.

Vice President Hatch reviewed the proposed budget documents with the Board.

Mr. Lucero asked if the actual rate increase was 12.5%. Vice President Hatch stated it was. Mr. Winslow asked if the public could be notified that the Board is not able to respond to the public due to open meeting laws. Chair Handorf explained to the public that the Board would hear public comment but not respond to it.

Brad Farber from Shumway asked Vice President Hatch to clarify that the tax increase was actually 12.5% not 4%. Vice President Hatch stated that Truth in Taxation laws were put into place at a time when there was an expectation that property valuations would always increase. When valuations increase the rate required to get the same property tax levy goes down. When this happens, Truth in Taxation does not say property taxes are decreasing because in even when the amount collected decreased it is still a property tax increase. When valuations go down, to maintain the levy at the same amount the rate has to go up. If assessed valuation goes down 10%
in any given property, the amount of tax that a person is going to pay may go down. The rate has to go up faster than the assessed valuation goes down.

Mr. Lucero asked why the College’s budget has to remain the same when everything else in economy is shrinking. Vice President Hatch stated that what the College offers is an investment in the future economy of the county and its communities. An investment in education at this point for those who need education throughout the county will benefit the communities in the long-run. The college is here to provide education and to benefit people through ongoing regular learning opportunities.

President Swarthout stated there are many outside costs that the College does not control, and that is the increasing cost of compliance with the state, federal, and accreditation agencies. As those compliance laws increase, the College has to add positions just to be federal, state, and accreditation compliant.

**Agenda Item 3: Call for Public Comment**

Brad Farber asked if nine campuses are too much for a population of only 123,000. Nine campuses are a huge expense, especially along with the other nine entities that are funded through property taxes in the county.

**Agenda Item 4: Adjournment**

*The meeting was adjourned at 10:46 a.m. upon a motion by Mr. Matteson, a second by Mr. Winslow, and a unanimous affirmative vote.*

Respectfully submitted,

Lisa Jayne

Recording Secretary to the Board